

Review of Government Advertising

INTRODUCTION

In reviewing our activities this past year with regard to the *Government Advertising Act, 2004* (Act), I wanted first to highlight an observation made in Australia, where the national and state governments have considered a variety of actions to ensure that public funds do not pay for partisan ads. Specifically, I was heartened to come across this recommendation in the 2008 report of a Legislative Committee in New South Wales, Australia: “That the Premier entrust the Auditor General with oversight responsibility for government advertising, with the Auditor General’s powers **to be modelled on those of the Auditor General in Ontario, Canada** [emphasis added].”

It is encouraging to note that after six years of existence, the Act may well be the gold standard by which other jurisdictions measure themselves in their drive to ensure that no public money is spent on partisan advertising.

The Act took effect in December 2005 after two years of debate in the Legislature—and several years of discussion prior to that—as legislators questioned the appropriateness of a government using public funds for advertising that could be considered to further its own partisan interests.

The main intent of the Act is to prohibit government advertising that may be viewed as promoting the governing party’s political interests by fostering a positive impression of the government or a negative impression of any group or person critical of

the government. Under the Act, most government advertisements must be submitted to and approved by the Auditor General before they can be used. The full text of the Act can be found at www.e-laws.gov.on.ca.

This chapter, which satisfies the legislative requirements in the Act as well as in the *Auditor General Act* to report annually to the Legislative Assembly, outlines the work we have done over the past year to ensure that the Act is adhered to.

Overview of the Advertising Review Function

Under the Act, the Auditor General is responsible for reviewing specified types of government advertisements to ensure that they meet legislated standards. Above all, they must not contain anything that is, or could be interpreted as being, primarily partisan in nature.

The Act outlines standards each advertisement must meet and states that “an item is partisan if, in the opinion of the Auditor General, a primary objective of the item is to promote the partisan political interests of the governing party.”

The Act also provides the Auditor General with the discretionary authority to consider additional factors in determining whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan political

interests of the governing party (see the “Other Factors” section later in this chapter).

WHAT FALLS UNDER THE ACT

The Act applies to advertisements that government offices—specifically, government ministries, Cabinet Office, and the Office of the Premier—propose to pay to have published in a newspaper or magazine, displayed on a billboard, or broadcast on radio or television. It also applies to printed matter that a government office proposes to pay to have distributed to households in Ontario either by bulk unaddressed mail or by another method of bulk delivery. Advertisements meeting any of these definitions are known as “reviewable” items and must be submitted to my Office for review and approval before they can run.

The Act excludes from review any job advertisement or notice to the public required by law. Also excluded are advertisements on the provision of goods and services to a government office and those on urgent matters affecting public health or safety.

Although the following are not specifically excluded by the Act, we have come to a mutual understanding with the government that they are not subject to the Act:

- electronic advertising on government websites or any public site, except for web pages identified and promoted in a reviewable item (see the “Websites” subsection later in this chapter); and
- brochures, pamphlets, newsletters, news releases, consultation documents, reports, and other similar printed matter, materials, or publications.

The Act requires government offices to submit every reviewable item to the Auditor General’s Office for review. The government office cannot publish, display, broadcast, distribute, or disseminate the submitted item until the head of that office, usually the deputy minister, receives notice, or is deemed to have received notice, that the advertisement has been approved.

The Auditor General’s Office, by regulation, has seven business days to render its decision. If we do not give notice within this time, the government office is deemed to have received notice that the item meets the standards of the Act, and the item may be run.

If my Office notifies the government office that the item does not meet the Act’s standards, the item may not be used. However, the government office may submit a revised version of the rejected item for another review. As with the first submission, my Office has seven days to render its decision.

Once an item has been approved, a government office may use it for the next 12 months. However, my Office can rescind an approval if we determine that new circumstances have changed the context in which the ad appears. Under the Act, all decisions of the Auditor General are final.

A pre-review is also available to government offices wishing us to examine an early version of an item. This can be a script or storyboard, provided that it reasonably reflects the item as it is intended to appear when completed. Pre-reviews help limit the investment of time and money spent to develop items containing material that could be deemed objectionable under the Act.

If material submitted for pre-review appears to violate the Act, we provide an explanation to the government office. If it appears to meet the standards of the Act, we so advise the government office. However, before the item can be used, the government office must submit the finished item for review to ensure that it still meets the standards of the Act.

A pre-review is strictly voluntary on our part and is outside the statutory requirements of the Act.

STANDARDS FOR PROPOSED ADVERTISEMENTS

In conducting its review, the Auditor General’s Office first determines whether the proposed advertisement meets the standards of the Act. These are:

- The item must be a reasonable means of achieving one or more of the following objectives:
 - to inform the public of current or proposed government policies, programs, or services;
 - to inform the public of its rights and responsibilities under the law;
 - to encourage or discourage specific social behaviour in the public interest; and/or
 - to promote Ontario, or any part of the province, as a good place to live, work, invest, study, or visit, or to promote any economic activity or sector of Ontario's economy.
- The item must include a statement that it is paid for by the government of Ontario.
- The item must not include the name, voice, or image of a member of the Executive Council (cabinet) or a member of the Legislative Assembly (unless the primary target audience is located outside Ontario, in which case the item is exempt from this requirement).
- The item must not have as a primary objective the fostering of a positive impression of the governing party, or a negative impression of a person or entity critical of the government.
- The item must not be partisan; that is, in the opinion of the Auditor General, it cannot have as a primary objective the promotion of the partisan interests of the governing party.
- contain subject matter relevant to government responsibilities (that is, the government should have direct and substantial responsibilities for the specific matters dealt with in the item);
- present information objectively, in tone and content, with facts expressed clearly and accurately, using unbiased and objective language;
- emphasize facts and/or explanations, not the political merits of proposals; and
- enable the audience to distinguish between fact on the one hand and comment, opinion, or analysis on the other.
- Items should not:
 - use colours, logos, and/or slogans commonly associated with any recognized political party in the Legislative Assembly of Ontario;
 - inappropriately personalize (for instance, by attacking opponents or critics);
 - directly or indirectly attack, ridicule, or criticize the views, policies, or actions of those critical of the government;
 - be aimed primarily at rebutting the arguments of others;
 - intentionally promote, or be perceived as promoting, political-party interests (to this end, consideration is also given to such matters as timing of the message, the audience it is aimed at, and the overall environment in which the message will be communicated);
 - deliver self-congratulatory or political-party image-building messages;
 - deal with matters such as a policy proposal where no decision has yet been made, unless the item provides a balanced explanation of both the benefits and the disadvantages;
 - present pre-existing policies, products, services, or activities as if they were new; or
 - use a uniform resource locator (URL) to direct readers, viewers, or listeners to a

OTHER FACTORS

In addition to the specific statutory standards above, the Act allows the Auditor General to consider additional factors to determine whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan interests of the governing party. In general, these additional factors relate to the overall impression conveyed by the ad and how it is likely to be perceived. Consideration is given to whether it includes certain desirable attributes and avoids certain undesirable ones. These are:

- Each item should:

“first click” web page with content that may not meet the standards required by the Act (see “Websites” in the following section).

OTHER REVIEW PROTOCOLS

Since taking on responsibility for reviewing government advertising, my Office has tried to clarify, in co-operation with government offices, areas where the Act is silent. What follows is a brief discussion of the main areas that have required clarification over the years.

Websites

Although websites are not specifically reviewable under the Act, we believe that a website used in an advertisement is seen as an extension of the ad. Following discussions with the government, we came to an agreement that the first page or “click” of a website accessed by using the URL in a reviewable item would be included in our review. We agreed not to consider web pages beyond the first click, unless that first click is a gateway page, in which case we review the next page. We examine reviewable web pages for any information or messages that may not meet the standards of the Act. For example, the page must not include a minister’s name, voice, or photograph, nor deliver self-congratulatory, party image–building messages, or messages that attack the policies, opinions, or actions of others.

Event/Conference Program Advertisements and Payments in Kind

Government advertisements sometimes appear in programs and other materials distributed at public events such as conferences, trade shows, and exhibitions. In considering this type of advertisement, we concluded that it should be subject to the Act because the programs usually follow the same format and serve a similar purpose as magazines and other print media. On the issue of payment for

these advertisements, government offices often make in-kind or financial contributions to an event, including paid sponsorship. Therefore, we consider the “free” advertisement to have been indirectly paid for.

Our rationale was based on the fact that the free advertisement is typically granted after the government office has made a financial contribution or sponsored the event. Government officials have agreed with this approach, and these items must be submitted for review.

Third-party Advertising

Government funds provided to third parties are sometimes used for advertising. The government and my Office have agreed that third-party advertising must be submitted for review if it meets all of the three following criteria:

- a government office provides the third party with funds intended to pay part or all of the cost of publishing, displaying, broadcasting, or distributing the item;
- the government grants the third party permission to use the Ontario logo or another official provincial visual identifier in the item; and
- the government office approves the content of the item.

Government Recruitment Advertisements

As previously noted, the Act excludes job advertisements from review. We have interpreted this exemption as applying to advertising for specific government jobs, but not to broad-ranging generic recruitment campaigns. The government has agreed with our interpretation and, as a result, generic recruitment campaigns must be submitted to my Office for review.

External Advisers

Under the *Auditor General Act*, the Auditor General can appoint an Advertising Commissioner to assist in fulfilling the requirements of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*. However, instead of appointing one Advertising Commissioner, my Office has engaged a number of external advisers to assist us in the ongoing review of items submitted for review. The following advisers have been engaged by my Office during the 2010/11 fiscal year:

- Rafe Engle is a Toronto lawyer specializing in advertising, marketing, communications, and entertainment law. He is also the outside legal counsel for Advertising Standards Canada, and Chair of its National Consumer Response Council. Before studying law, Mr. Engle acquired a comprehensive background in media and communications while working in the advertising industry.
- Jonathan Rose is Associate Professor of Political Studies at Queen's University. He is a leading Canadian academic with interests in political advertising and Canadian politics. Professor Rose has written a book on government advertising in Canada and a number of articles on the way in which political parties and governments use advertising.
- Joel Ruimy is a Toronto communications consultant with three decades of experience as a journalist, editor, and producer covering Ontario and national politics in print and television.
- John Sciarra is the former director of operations in my Office. He was instrumental in leading the implementation of our advertising review function and in drafting the guidelines that help ministries comply with the Act.

These advisers provided invaluable assistance in our review of government advertising this past fiscal year.

Advertising Review Activity, 2010/11

RESULTS OF OUR REVIEWS

During the 2010/11 fiscal year, we reviewed 1,082 individual advertising items in 165 submissions, with a total value of \$50 million. This compares to 159 submissions, comprising 600 individual ads, with a value of more than \$40 million last year.

We gave our decision in all cases within the required seven business days. The length of time required for a review and decision can vary, depending on the complexity of the ad and on the other work priorities of our review panel. Nevertheless, average turnaround time during the past fiscal year was 3.5 business days.

We also received and examined 22 pre-review submissions at a preliminary stage of development. Because pre-reviews are strictly voluntary on our part and outside the statutory requirements of the Act, they are second in priority to finished items. We nonetheless make every effort to complete them within a reasonable time. The average turnaround time for pre-review submissions in the 2010/11 fiscal year was 5.9 business days.

Of all the final submissions received in the 2010/11 fiscal year, we rejected two:

- A newspaper advertising campaign relating to the 10% rebate on electricity bills under the Ontario Clean Energy Benefit was rejected on the grounds that its primary objective was to foster a positive impression of the government party, contrary to section 6(1)5 of the Act. After reworking the campaign, the Ministry of Energy resubmitted it and we approved it.
- A template for a newspaper ad announcing “expanded” diabetes programs across the province was rejected primarily for failing to provide evidence that the program had in fact been expanded in every location. The Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care did not resubmit the ad.

We also rescinded previously granted approval for three other digital video and television ads that were part of a campaign on medical wait times from the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care after the Liberal Party of Ontario released an ad with strikingly similar visuals on the same subject.

We also noted two contraventions of the Act—advertisements that ran without having first been submitted to us for review, as follows:

- For the second straight year, the Ontario Provincial Police, which is overseen by the Ministry of Community Safety and Correctional Services, ran ads that it had not first submitted for review. The OPP advised that the contraventions were due to a lack of familiarity with the Act. We determined that had these six ads been submitted, they would have been approved.
- More than 100 ads in various media relating to Huronia Historical Parks and Fort William Historical Park ran without first having been submitted for review. These attractions are part of the Ministry of Tourism and Culture and thus covered by the Act. The Ministry advised us it has taken steps to ensure that the parks will submit all future ads for review. The ads that ran in contravention of the Act would likely have been approved if they had been submitted for review.

As well, we also had serious concerns on a number of pre-review submissions. In almost all instances, these were revised, resubmitted, and subsequently approved.

OTHER MATTERS

Election Timing

We noted in our *2007 Annual Report* that the decision to hold provincial elections on fixed dates every four years made it “important to consider how publicly funded government advertising should be dealt with in a pre-election period.”

At the time, we warned that “noticeable changes in the character, content, emphasis, or volume of government advertising in the period before a general election may be perceived as giving the governing party an advantage,” and added that we “would consider not only the content of each advertising item, but also the current political circumstances and the timing of the planned publication or dissemination of the item.”

We found issues with a few submissions in the months leading up to the most recent election on October 6, 2011—for example, the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care failed to provide the required notification of its plans to buy additional air time for previously approved radio and television ads.

We also rejected two submissions and cited a third in violation of the Act in the months leading up to the election, as follows:

- We rejected a radio campaign promoting the availability of free vaccinations for the rotavirus because it loosely resembled a Liberal Party of Ontario commercial on the medical screening of newborn infants. The Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care reworked the ad and resubmitted it, and we approved it.
- We rejected a print and radio campaign about agricultural risk-management programs because it violated section 6(1)5 of the Act, which says that an ad must not have as a primary objective to “foster a positive impression of the governing party.” After quickly reworking the campaign, the Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs resubmitted it and we approved it.
- We found an approved Ministry of Finance campaign on Ontario Savings Bonds in violation after the first-click web page promoted in the ad contained a reference to the “McGuinty government,” in contravention of section 6(1)3 of the Act, which says ads “must not include the name, voice or image of a member of the Executive Council or a member of the Assembly.” The Ministry quickly corrected it.

We would also like to point out a possible limitation to the Act relating to a mail insert from the Ministry of Energy that was included with electricity bills just prior to the election. The insert touted the Ontario Clean Energy Benefit, the government's 10% reduction on electricity bills for the next five years. We understand that utilities were required by the Ministry to include these inserts. Such inserts are not subject to the Act, which covers only undressed bulk mail. However, we were concerned that the inserts, some of which arrived in mailboxes less than a month before the provincial election, could be seen as violating the intent of the Act. The insert likely would not have passed our review if it had been submitted to us. We expressed similar concerns last year regarding an insert included with HST rebate cheques. Both these examples highlight a possible limitation of the Act with respect to such inserts.

Internet Advertising

In our *2010 Annual Report*, we cited an instance of a government ad running on-line that was similar to an ad we identified in 2009 as not meeting the required standards of the Act. We noted at the time that this underscored the limitations of the Act, which does not cover Internet advertising, a fast-growing segment of the advertising market.

In the 2010/11 fiscal year, we noted that many reviewable ad campaigns included Internet components, some of which could have been found in violation of the Act had they been subject to our review. With the total value and number of Internet ads continuing to grow, the government should consider whether including Internet ads in the Act warrants consideration.

Ministry of Infrastructure

In September 2009, the then Ministry of Energy and Infrastructure submitted a television ad, called "Connects," for pre-review. We indicated at the time that the ad, which dealt with the merits of infra-

structure, would likely not meet the standards of the Act because it contained little information and appeared self-congratulatory. The Ministry did not revise or resubmit the ad.

In May 2011, we learned that Infrastructure Ontario, a provincial Crown corporation not governed by the Act, intended to launch a television campaign using an ad very much like the "Connects" one we had rejected almost two years earlier.

We advised the Ministry of Infrastructure of our concern that the Ministry may have knowingly allowed one of its agencies—an agency that reports to the Minister of Infrastructure—to run advertising very similar to advertising that had already been submitted in 2009 for pre-review and that had been found by my Office to have failed to meet the standards of the Act.

In response, a senior official of Infrastructure Ontario advised us that his staff were unaware of the 2009 version of the ad, prepared by the same agency that created the 2011 version. They expressed dissatisfaction with the fact that the ad agency was not more forthright in letting them know it was a second attempt at airing essentially the same ad that had been turned down previously.

Our Office was informed by Infrastructure Ontario in September 2011 that the ad had not run.

Expenditures on Advertisements and Printed Matter

The *Auditor General Act* requires that the Auditor General report annually to the Legislative Assembly on expenditures for advertisements, printed matter, and messages that are reviewable under the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*.

Figure 1 contains expenditure details of individual advertising campaigns reported to us by each ministry for media-buy costs; agency creative costs;

third-party production, talent, and distribution costs; and other third-party costs, such as translation.

In order to test the completeness and accuracy of the reported advertising expenditures, my Office reviewed randomly selected payments to suppliers of advertising and creative services and their supporting documentation at selected ministries. We also performed certain compliance procedures with respect to the requirements of sections 2, 3, 4, and 8 of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*, which pertain to submission requirements and prohibition on the use of items pending the Auditor General's review. We found no matters of concern in our review work.

Figure 1: Expenditures for Reviewable Advertisements and Printed Matter under the Government Advertising Act, 2004, April 1, 2010–March 31, 2011

Source of data: Ontario government offices

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs							
Foodland Ontario ²	4	51	173,675	989,886	55,334	–	228
Invest in Ontario ²	1	2	–	–	–	–	–
Ontario's Bio Advantage	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Pick Ontario Freshness ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Royal Winter Fair	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Cabinet Office							
Institute of Public Administration of Canada	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Children and Youth Services							
Ontario Child Benefit	2	19	31,900	27,910	22,500	–	5,700
Citizenship and Immigration							
Global Experience Ontario	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Order of Ontario	1	23	–	5,386	–	–	–
Remembrance Day	1	3	–	946	–	–	–
Community Safety and Correctional Services							
OPP ⁴	–	6	–	–	–	–	–
Public Notice – Security Industry Workers ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
RIDE	2	2	–	–	14,427	–	–
RIDE ¹	–	–	–	78	–	–	–
Economic Development and Trade							
Business Immigration	1	10	5,143	7,000	–	–	2,815
Domestic Business Programs	1	4	241,485	388,253	95,100	–	1,820
Go North ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Go North ²	6	24	189,508	30,186	–	–	9,507
Invest Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Invest Ontario ²	15	92	846,563	153,959	56,942	–	26,970
Ontario Exports	3	10	12,325	3,475	–	–	1,739
Ontario Exports ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Education							
Education Summit	1	2	–	–	–	–	–
Full-day Kindergarten ²	7	62	249,076	361,366	148,165	–	16,833
Kidstreet	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
Speak Up	1	1	–	–	–	–	–

1. ad submission from 2009/10, with more expenditures in 2010/11

2. ad submission from 2010/11, with more expenditures in 2011/12

4. contravention—ad was not submitted for review

9. negative total due to media credits being applied

TV	Media Costs (\$)			Ad Value† (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
2,865,421	528,854	–	341,825	–	4,955,223
–	–	4,961	–	–	4,961
–	–	–	–	3,500	3,500
–	1,885	–	–	–	1,885
–	–	–	–	2,850	2,850
–	–	–	–	4,000	4,000
–	45,784	244,191	–	–	377,985
–	–	1,250	–	–	1,250
–	–	141,019	–	–	146,405
–	–	26,576	–	–	27,522
–	–	330	–	–	330
–	–	61,366	–	–	61,366
256,949	–	–	19,642	–	291,018
-2,510	–	–	–	–	-2,432 ⁹
–	–	199,569	–	–	214,527
834,721	–	86,241	–	–	1,647,620
–	–	45,465	–	–	45,465
–	–	625,509	–	3,740	858,450
-34,175	–	-21,770	-17,284	9,600	-63,629 ⁹
2,062,017	–	3,398,137	598,445	4,060	7,147,093
–	–	2,078	–	–	19,617
–	–	42,628	–	5,000	47,628
–	–	–	–	10,821	10,821
3,558,749	–	279,748	–	–	4,613,937
–	–	–	–	1,413	1,413
–	–	–	–	30,000	30,000

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
Energy and Infrastructure							
Infrastructure ¹	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Long-term Energy Plan ²	3	11	122,527	463,177	1,364	—	368,219
Long-term Energy Plan ³	1	4	—	—	—	—	—
Environment							
Public Notice – Air Standards	2	3	—	575	—	—	—
Public Notice – Environmental Sampling	1	1	—	375	—	—	—
Finance							
Children's Activity Tax Credit	4	61	198,143	159,934	12,430	—	19,492
Ontario Budget ²	2	24	42,848	42,558	—	—	—
Ontario Savings Bonds	2	37	108,936	95,096	75,340	—	10,385
Government Services							
1-888-Business Info Line	1	4	—	6,007	—	—	2,048
Smartmoves ¹	—	—	—	4,900	—	—	256
Taking the Lead – ServiceOntario	1	2	—	—	—	—	4
Taking the Lead – ServiceOntario ¹	—	—	—	—	—	—	2,162
Validation Sticker Renewal	1	19	15,600	9,200	—	—	2,682
Health and Long-Term Care							
Diabetes Programs ³	1	1	—	—	—	—	—
Health Care Connect	1	2	2,013	9,431	—	—	775
Health Care Options ²	13	54	122,194	91,540	—	—	56,149
Health Care Options ⁶	3	12	25,046	1,074,554	65,093	1,205	9,801
HealthForceOntario ⁸	1	1	—	—	—	—	—
MedsCheck for Diabetes Patients	1	2	—	10,944	1,435	2,100	731
Public Notice – Diabetes ¹	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Public Notice – Northern Health Care Services Co-ordination	1	6	—	—	—	—	—
Seasonal Flu	5	68	20,528	20,158	12,062	—	4,039
Stand Up to Diabetes	4	50	—	20,400	—	—	—
Health Promotion and Sport							
Diabetes ²	2	3	175,628	172,230	—	—	1,995
EatRight Ontario ¹	—	—	—	—	—	—	—
Healthy Living	1	2	333,955	454,743	—	—	—
World Junior Baseball ²	1	1	1,105	—	—	—	—
Labour							
Employment Standards	1	10	—	26,837	—	—	2,962
Falls Prevention ⁵	2	15	—	—	—	—	—

1. ad submission from 2009/10, with more expenditures in 2010/11

2. ad submission from 2010/11, with more expenditures in 2011/12

3. violation—ad was reviewed and did not meet the required standards

5. costs incurred by WSIB

6. approval withdrawn (see the "Results of Our Reviews" section earlier in this chapter)

8. costs incurred by HealthForceOntario

9. negative total due to media credits being applied

Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value† (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
-1,513	—	—	—	—	-1,513 ⁹
899,009	644,462	—	—	—	2,498,758
—	—	—	—	—	—
—	—	2,853	—	—	3,428
—	—	2,588	—	—	2,963
—	577,004	582,396	168,810	—	1,718,209
—	—	62,094	—	—	147,500
798,725	145,687	499,562	276,209	—	2,009,940
—	—	71,667	—	—	79,722
—	—	19,586	—	—	24,742
—	—	3,980	—	—	3,984
—	—	369,497	—	—	371,659
—	—	37,723	—	—	65,205
—	—	—	—	—	—
—	—	104,083	—	—	116,302
—	10,157	1,632,489	263,488	—	2,176,017
2,567,247	—	—	—	—	3,742,946
—	—	—	—	—	—
—	562,330	—	—	—	577,540
—	—	311,891	—	—	311,891
—	—	19,053	—	—	19,053
—	1,366,943	—	491,029	—	1,914,759
—	—	999,534	—	3,250	1,023,184
—	—	—	—	—	349,853
—	—	5,766	—	—	5,766
1,057,934	—	—	—	—	1,846,632
—	—	—	—	650	1,755
—	—	129,503	—	—	159,302
—	—	—	—	—	—

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
Labour (continued)							
Jobs Protection Office	1	2	–	2,500	–	–	–
Safe at Work Ontario	1	1	–	1,978	–	–	–
Municipal Affairs and Housing							
Public Notice – Provincial Policy Statement Review	1	2	–	632	–	–	110
Natural Resources							
Bear Wise	1	8	–	650	–	–	–
Bear Wise ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Chronic Wasting Disease	1	1	–	–	–	–	–
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention ¹	–	–	–	100	–	–	–
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention ²	2	30	–	685	–	–	6
Forest Resource Management ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Kids Fish Art Contest	1	1	–	100	–	–	–
Lake Ontario Atlantic Salmon Restoration	1	1	–	375	–	–	–
Land Management ²	8	8	–	–	–	–	–
Ontario Parks ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Ontario Parks ²	15	17	–	–	–	–	–
Outdoors Card	1	1	–	150	–	–	–
Species at Risk	2	2	–	356	–	–	–
Youth Employment	1	1	–	175	–	–	–
Northern Development, Mines and Forestry							
GO North ⁷	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Northern Ontario Energy Credit ²	3	11	275,625	267,793	–	–	7,500
Northern Ontario Heritage Credit ²	2	4	–	–	–	–	–
Public Notice - Forest Tenure and Pricing Review	1	2	–	2,300	–	–	–
Research and Innovation							
Invest Ontario ⁷	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
Revenue							
Comprehensive Tax Reform ¹	–	–	3,696	–	–	–	–
Ontario's Tax Plan	9	55	106,015	51,680	27,990	589,803	45,705
Tax Credits ²	3	40	344,247	174,637	16,611	–	–
Tourism and Culture							
Fort William Historical Park ⁴	–	49	–	–	–	–	–
Huronian Historical Parks ⁴	–	67	–	5,540	–	–	–
Training, Colleges and Universities							
Employment Ontario ¹	–	–	–	–	–	–	–

1. ad submission from 2009/10, with more expenditures in 2010/11

2. ad submission from 2010/11, with more expenditures in 2011/12

4. contravention—ad was not submitted for review

7. ad developed by another ministry, but used by this ministry

Media Costs (\$)				Ad Value† (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
–	–	2,125	–	–	4,625
–	–	–	–	2,490	4,468
–	–	23,403	–	–	24,145
20,452	–	95,117	2,996	–	119,215
–	–	93,983	–	–	93,983
–	–	1,369	–	–	1,369
–	–	1,693	–	–	1,793
–	–	699	–	–	1,390
–	–	916	–	–	916
–	–	–	–	8,350	8,450
–	–	–	–	11,140	11,515
–	–	3,609	–	2,775	6,384
–	–	7,516	–	–	7,516
–	–	17,190	–	–	17,190
–	–	–	–	8,350	8,500
–	–	34,284	–	–	34,640
–	–	–	–	7,300	7,475
–	–	1,966	–	–	1,966
121,929	122,984	111,261	–	–	907,092
–	–	1,290	–	13,355	14,645
–	–	30,978	–	–	33,278
–	–	–	–	21,900	21,900
–	531,681	716,201	–	–	1,251,578
–	935,740	1,114,004	–	–	2,870,937
–	–	–	–	–	535,495
–	27,448	109,125	182,462	–	319,035
44,955	16,663	58,150	2,700	350	128,358
–	–	–	–	4,250	4,250

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Third-party Costs (\$)				
			Agency Fees	Production	Talent	Bulk Mail	Other
Training, Colleges and Universities (continued)							
International Education	1	1	—	—	—	—	—
Postsecondary Awareness & Public Education	2	66	325,141	625,014	56,966	—	21,801
Study in Ontario	1	1	—	—	—	—	1,805
Transportation							
Veterans Graphic Licence Plates	1	2	4,293	2,008	11,856	—	—
Total	165	1,082	3,977,215	5,767,777	673,615	593,108	624,239

1. ad submission from 2009/10, with more expenditures in 2010/11

TV	Media Costs (\$)			Ad Value [†] (\$)	Campaign Total (\$)
	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*		
–	–	5,391	–	–	5,391
1,289,855	–	791,174	300,283	–	3,410,234
–	–	4,545	–	–	6,350
556,639	–	10,393	–	–	585,189
16,896,404	5,517,622	13,227,945	2,630,605	159,144	50,067,674

* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

† Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.