

# The Auditor General's Review of Government Advertising

The idea of the Auditor General's reviewing government advertising arose in the mid-1990s, when legislators expressed concern about the appropriateness of a government's use of public funds for advertising that could be considered to further partisan interests. In late 2004, the Legislative Assembly enacted the *Government Advertising Act, 2004* (Act). Its intention is to prohibit government advertising that may be viewed as promoting the governing party's interests by fostering a positive impression of the government or a negative impression of any group or person critical of the government. Under the Act, which can be found at [www.e-laws.gov.on.ca](http://www.e-laws.gov.on.ca), advertisements must be submitted to and approved by the Auditor General before they can be used.

This report on government advertising satisfies the legislative requirements in the Act, as well as the *Auditor General Act*, to report annually to the Speaker. The report is intended to:

- provide a means to discuss publicly those matters concerning the exercise of the Auditor General's powers and duties under the Act [subsection 9(1)];
- report any contraventions of the requirements of the Act [subsection 9(2)]; and
- report on expenditures for advertisements, printed matter, and messages that were reviewed by the Office of the Auditor General under the Act, from April 1, 2007, to

March 31, 2008 [subsection 12(2)(g) of the *Auditor General Act*].

During the 2007/08 fiscal year, we received and reviewed 184 advertising submissions comprising 914 individual advertising items, with a total cost of more than \$53 million. Of all the submissions reviewed, we determined that one submission, comprising five ads, fostered a positive impression of the governing party—a violation of section 6(1)5 of the Act. The advertisements were subsequently revised, resubmitted, and approved. We also identified five contraventions of the Act—three advertisements and two advertorials that were published without first having been submitted to our Office for review and approval. Had these five items been submitted in advance, two would not have been approved. The Advertising Review Activity, 2007/08 section of this chapter provides specific details on reviews conducted, contraventions of the Act, and expenditures on advertisements and printed matter.

## Overview of the Government Advertising Review Function

Under the Act, the Auditor General is responsible for reviewing specified types of government advertising to ensure that they meet legislated standards and that, above all, they do not contain anything

that is, or may be interpreted as being, primarily partisan in nature. The Act states that “an item is partisan, if, in the opinion of the Auditor General, a primary objective of the item is to promote the partisan political interest of the governing party.”

## ENTITIES SUBJECT TO THE ACT

The Act applies to government offices, which it defines as ministries, Cabinet Office, the Office of the Premier, and such other entities as may be designated by regulation (as yet, no other entity has been designated). The Act requires every government office to submit proposed advertising, printed matter, or prescribed messages that are reviewable to the Auditor General's Office for a determination of whether they meet the standards of the Act.

## REVIEWABLE ADVERTISING

The Act requires that the Auditor General review the following:

- any advertisement in any language that a government office proposes to pay for publishing in a newspaper or magazine, displaying on a billboard, or broadcasting on radio or television; and
- printed matter in any language that a government office proposes to pay for distributing to households in Ontario either by bulk mail or by another method of bulk delivery.

Items meeting either of these definitions are known as reviewable items.

## Exceptions

The Act specifically excludes from review any advertisement or printed matter that is a job advertisement or a notice to the public required by law. Also excluded are advertisements concerning the provision of goods and services to a government office and those regarding an urgent matter affecting public health or safety.

The following are not specifically mentioned in the Act as excluded, although it is understood that they are not subject to the Act:

- electronic advertising on the government's own websites or any public site, except for web pages promoted through reference to their uniform resource locator (URL) in a reviewable item (see the Websites subsection later in this chapter); and
- brochures, pamphlets, newsletters, news releases, consultation documents, reports, and other similar printed matter, materials, or publications.

## REQUIREMENTS FOR SUBMISSION AND USE OF ADVERTISING ITEMS

Sections 2, 3, 4, and 8 of the Act require that:

- a government office submit a copy of the proposed reviewable advertisement, printed matter, or message to the Auditor General's Office for review;
- a government office not publish, display, broadcast, distribute, or disseminate the submitted item:
  - before the head (that is, the deputy minister) of that office receives notice, or is deemed to have received notice, of the results of the review; or
  - if the head has received notice from the Auditor General that the item does not meet the standards required by the Act;
- when a government office proposes to use a revised version of a rejected item, the revised version be submitted to the Auditor General's Office for a further review; and
- a government office not use the revised version:
  - before the head of that office receives notice, or is deemed to have received notice, of the results of the review; or

- if the head has received notice from the Auditor General that the revised version does not meet the standards required by the Act.

## REVIEW PERIOD AND NOTIFICATION OF THE AUDITOR GENERAL'S DECISION

By regulation, the Auditor General has seven business days from receipt of an item in finished form to notify a government office of the results of a review. Under the Act, if notice is not given within that time, the government office is deemed to have received notice that the item meets the standards of the Act.

If a finished item submitted for review does not meet the standards required by the Act, the government office may submit a revised version for a second review. As with the initial review, the Auditor General has seven business days from receipt to notify the government office of the results of this new review. If notice is not given within that time, the government office is deemed to have received notice that the revised version meets the standards of the Act.

Once an item has been approved, a government office may use it for the next 12 months. Under the Act, all decisions of the Auditor General are final.

## STATUTORY STANDARDS TO BE MET BY REVIEWABLE ITEMS

In conducting its review, the Auditor General's Office first determines whether a reviewable item meets all of the standards of the Act, as follows:

- The item must be a reasonable means of achieving one or more of the following objectives:
  - to inform the public of current or proposed government policies, programs, or services available to them;
  - to inform the public of its rights and responsibilities under the law;

- to encourage or discourage specific social behaviour in the public interest; and/or
- to promote Ontario, or any part of the province, as a good place to live, work, invest, study, or visit, or to promote any economic activity or sector of Ontario's economy.
- The item must include a statement that it is paid for by the government of Ontario.
- The item must not include the name, voice, or image of a member of the Executive Council or a member of the Legislative Assembly (unless the primary target audience is located outside Ontario, in which case the item is exempt from this requirement).
- The item must not have as a primary objective the fostering of a positive impression of the governing party, or a negative impression of a person or entity critical of the government.
- The item must not be partisan; that is, in the opinion of the Auditor General, it cannot have as a primary objective the promotion of the partisan political interests of the governing party.

## OTHER FACTORS CONSIDERED

In addition to the specific statutory standards above, the Act allows the Auditor General to consider additional factors he or she deems appropriate to determine whether a primary objective of an item is to promote the partisan political interests of the governing party [subsection 6(4)].

In general, the additional factors incorporated into the review process relate to the general impression conveyed by the message and how it is likely to be received or perceived. In determining whether an item may be perceived or received as partisan, consideration is given to whether it includes certain desirable characteristics and avoids certain undesirable ones, as follows:

- Each item should:
  - contain subject matter relevant to government responsibilities (that is, the government should have direct and substantial

responsibilities for the specific matters dealt with in the item);

- present information objectively, in tone and content, with facts expressed clearly and accurately using unbiased and objective language;
- emphasize facts and/or explanations, not the political merits of proposals; and
- enable the audience to distinguish between fact on the one hand and comment, opinion, or analysis on the other.
- Items should not:
  - use colours, logos, and/or slogans commonly associated with any recognized political party in the Legislative Assembly of Ontario;
  - inappropriately personalize (for instance, by personally attacking opponents or critics);
  - directly or indirectly attack, ridicule, or criticize the views, policies, or actions of those critical of government;
  - aim primarily at rebutting the arguments of others;
  - intentionally promote, or be perceived as promoting, political-party interests (to this end, consideration is also given to such matters as timing of the message, the audience it is aimed at, and the overall environment in which the message will be communicated);
  - deliver self-congratulatory or political-party image-building messages;
  - deal with matters such as a policy proposal where no decision has yet been made, unless the item provides a balanced explanation of both the benefits and the disadvantages;
  - present pre-existing policies, products, services, or activities as if they were new; or
  - use a uniform resource locator (URL) to direct readers, viewers, or listeners to a “first click” web page with content that may

not meet the standards required by the Act (see Websites).

## OTHER REVIEW PROTOCOLS

### Websites

Websites referred to in an advertisement are technically not reviewable under the Act. However, we felt that a website used in an ad could be seen as a continuation of the ad. In discussing this with the government, we came to the agreement that the first page accessed by the “first click” of the URL would be included in our review. We do not consider web pages beyond the first click. We review the first-click page for any information or messages that may not meet the standards of the Act. For example, it must not include a minister’s name, voice, or photograph, nor deliver self-congratulatory, party image-building messages, or messages that attack the policies, opinions, or actions of others.

### Public-event and Conference-program Advertisements and Payments in Kind

With respect to government advertisements in programs distributed at public events and conferences, we felt that these advertisements should be subject to the Act because the programs usually follow the same format and serve a similar purpose as magazines and other print media (that is, ads are interspersed with content).

Advertising space in public-event and conference programs is at times provided to a government office free of charge. However, if the government office has made any kind of financial contribution to the event, including paid sponsorship, we consider this free advertisement to have been indirectly paid for. In considering this matter, we asked the following question: would the free advertisement have been granted to the government office if it had not made a financial contribution or sponsored the event? The answer would often be “no.” Government officials have agreed with this approach to

advertisements in programs distributed at public events and conferences. Consequently, items in these programs are considered reviewable under the Act and must be submitted for review.

### Third-party Advertising

Recognizing that government funds are sometimes spent on advertising by third parties, the government and our Office have agreed that where a third party (not a government office) pays all or part of the cost of an advertising item, the government office must submit the item to us for review if it meets all three of the following criteria:

- a government office provides the third party with funds intended to pay part or all of the cost of publishing, displaying, broadcasting, or distributing the item; and
- the government of Ontario grants the third party permission to use the Ontario logo or another official provincial visual identifier in the item; and
- the government office approves the content of the item.

### Government Recruitment Ads

As already mentioned, the Act specifically excludes a job advertisement from review. We have interpreted this exemption to apply to advertising for specific government jobs, but not to broad-ranging generic recruitment campaigns. During the year, we noted a violation when an advertisement for a recruitment campaign was not submitted to us for review in advance. We communicated our interpretation to the government, which agreed with it. Had the ad been submitted in advance, it would have been approved (see Figure 1).

### Environmental Assessment Notices for Provincial Parks and Conservation Reserves

The Act exempts government notices required by law from the Auditor General's review. However, since the Act came into force, the Ministry of Natural Resources had routinely been submitting for review and approval advertisements for certain classes of environmental assessment notices. We discussed this with representatives of that ministry and came to an agreement that, because of the statutory nature of these advertisements, they would no longer require clearance through our Office.

### Pre-reviews and Consultations

A pre-review is available to government offices wishing to have us examine an early version of an item. This can be a script or storyboard, provided that it reasonably and accurately reflects the item as it is intended to appear when completed. Pre-reviews help limit the investment of time and money spent to develop items containing material that we may deem objectionable under the Act.

If material submitted for pre-review appears to violate any of the standards in the Act, we provide explanatory comments to the government office. If it appears to meet the standards of the Act, we so advise the government office. However, before the item can be published, displayed, broadcast, printed, or otherwise disseminated, the government office must submit the finished item for review to ensure that the finished version still meets the standards of the Act.

A pre-review is strictly voluntary on our part and is outside the statutory requirements of the Act.

**Figure 1: Contraventions of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*, April 1, 2007–March 31, 2008**

Prepared by the Office of the Auditor General of Ontario

Ministry	Description
Economic Development and Trade	Two advertorials promoting stem cell research in Ontario were published in German and French newspapers without first having been submitted to the Auditor General's Office for review and approval. Had the advertorials been submitted for review, they would have been approved as meeting the standards of the Act.
Environment	An advertisement was published in the Green Living Show Program Guide without first having been submitted to the Auditor General's Office for review and approval. Had it been submitted, the advertisement would not have met the prescribed standards because one of the URLs used in the advertisement brought users to a "first-click" web page that featured the name and image of the Minister and content that we believed to be partisan.
Government and Consumer Services	A generic recruitment advertisement was published as part of a supplement to a major newspaper without first having been submitted to the Auditor General's Office for review and approval. Although the Act specifically excludes a job advertisement from review, we have interpreted this exception to apply to advertising for specific government jobs, and not to a broad-ranging recruitment campaign such as this advertisement featured. Had the ad been submitted for review, it would have been approved as meeting the standards of the Act.
Health Promotion	An advertisement was published in the Doors Open Ontario 2007 Guide distributed by a major newspaper without first having been submitted to the Auditor General's Office for review and approval. Had it been submitted, the advertisement would not have met the prescribed standards because one of the URLs used in the advertisement brought users to a "first-click" web page that featured the name and image of the Minister and content that we believed to be partisan.

## External Advisors

Under the *Auditor General Act*, the Auditor General can appoint an Advertising Commissioner to assist in fulfilling the requirements of the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*. However, instead of appointing an Advertising Commissioner, our Office has engaged external advisors to give assistance and advice in the ongoing review of items submitted for review. The following advisors have been engaged at various times by our Office during the 2007/08 fiscal year:

- Rafe Engle is a Toronto lawyer who specializes in advertising, marketing, communications, and entertainment law. He is also the outside legal counsel for Advertising Standards Canada. Before studying law, Mr. Engle acquired a comprehensive background in media and communications while working in the advertising industry.
- Jonathan Rose is Associate Professor of Political Studies at Queen's University. He is a leading Canadian academic with interests in political advertising and Canadian politics. Professor Rose has written a book on government advertising in Canada and a number of

articles on the way in which political parties and governments use advertising.

- Joel Ruimy is a Toronto communications consultant with many years of experience as a journalist, editor, and producer covering Ontario politics in print and television.

These advisors have provided invaluable assistance in our review of government advertising this year.

## Advertising Review Activity, 2007/08

### RESULTS OF OUR REVIEWS

During the 2007/08 fiscal year, we received and reviewed 184 advertising submissions comprising 914 individual reviewable items, with a total cost of more than \$53 million.

As previously noted, the Act requires the Auditor General to notify a government office of the results of a review within seven business days of receiving an item. In 2007/08, we provided our decision in all cases within the required seven-day period. The length of time required for a review and decision can vary, depending on the complexity of the message contained in the item(s) and on the other work priorities of our review panel. Nevertheless, our average turnaround time for submissions was about four business days.

We also received and reviewed 11 pre-review submissions that were at a preliminary stage of development, most often at the script or storyboard level. Because pre-reviews are strictly voluntary on our part and outside the statutory requirements of the Act, they are second in priority to finished items. Nonetheless, we make every attempt to complete the pre-reviews within a reasonable length of time. The average turnaround time for pre-review submissions in 2007/08 was about five business days.

Of the 184 submissions reviewed, we determined that one submission by the Ministry of Children and Youth Services on the child benefit, comprising five ads, fostered a positive impression of the governing party—a violation of section 6(1) 5 of the Act. The Ministry subsequently revised the ads and submitted them for further review under subsection 8(1) of the Act, and our Office approved them.

We also withdrew approval that we had previously granted to the Ministry of Energy for four submissions on energy conservation, comprising 30 ads, after the name of the recognizable personality featured in the ads appeared in a political campaign document endorsing a government policy. This raised concerns in our minds that the ads could be interpreted by the public as fostering a positive impression of the governing party.

We also had five contraventions of the Act where advertisements were published without first having been submitted for review. Had the five items been submitted in advance, two would not have been approved, as outlined in Figure 1.

### EXPENDITURES ON ADVERTISEMENTS AND PRINTED MATTER

The *Auditor General Act* requires that the Auditor General report annually to the Legislative Assembly on expenditures for advertisements, printed matter and messages that are reviewable under the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*.

Figure 2 contains expenditure details of individual advertising campaigns by each ministry for media-buy costs; agency creative costs; third-party production, talent, and distribution costs; and other third-party costs, such as translation. The information contained in Figure 2 was compiled by government offices and provided to the Auditor General's Office.

In order to test the completeness and accuracy of the reported advertising expenditures, the Auditor

General's Office performed a review of randomly selected payments to suppliers of advertising and creative services and their supporting documentation at selected ministries.

During our visits to selected government offices to verify reported expenditure information, we also performed certain compliance procedures with respect to the requirements of sections 2, 3, 4, and 8 of the Act, which pertain to submission requirements and prohibition on the use of items pending the Auditor General's review. No exceptions were noted.



**Figure 2: Expenditures for Reviewable Advertisements and Printed Matter under the *Government Advertising Act, 2004*, April 1, 2007–March 31, 2008**

Source of data: Ontario government offices

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
<b>Agriculture, Food and Rural Affairs</b>					
Event Program Messages	5	6	–	–	–
Foodland Ontario <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	20,000
Foodland Ontario <sup>2</sup>	1	9	–	–	–
Good Things Grow in Ontario/Pick Ontario Freshness	6	14	150,038	1,050,262	225,000
Ontario's Food and Beverage Sector	1	1	–	–	–
<b>Children and Youth Services</b>					
Ontario Child Benefit <sup>3</sup>	1	5	–	–	–
Ontario Child Benefit	3	36	202,240	402,987	45,434
<b>Citizenship and Immigration</b>					
Global Experience Ontario—Services for Newcomers	2	21	18,215	62,565	–
Order of Ontario	1	2	750	1,025	–
Preventing Violence Against Women <sup>1</sup>	–	–	2,687	2,107	15,106
Remembrance Day Ceremony	1	2	–	754	–
<b>Community and Social Services</b>					
AccessON: Breaking Barriers Together	1	13	84,120	111,495	–
Adoption	1	2	61,750	43,057	–
<b>Community Safety and Correctional Services</b>					
Emergency Survival	1	1	–	–	–
Even Program Message	1	1	–	–	–
Private Security and Investigative Services Act, 2005	1	2	–	–	–
RIDE Program, 2007	2	9	–	895	10,011
<b>Economic Development and Trade</b>					
Economy—Works for Me <sup>2</sup>	1	1	35,000	25,000	32,750
Event Program Message	1	1	–	2,808	–
Invest Ontario & Go North <sup>1</sup>	–	–	2,380	5,841	–
Invest Ontario & Go North	7	112	1,165,997	145,977	–
Invest Ontario & Go North <sup>4</sup>	–	–	–	137,453	–
Next Generation of Jobs Fund <sup>2</sup>	1	3	58,098	2,283	–
<b>Energy</b>					
Ontario Home Energy Audit Program	1	1	44,950	76,748	–
Ontario Solar Thermal Heating Incentive <sup>2</sup>	1	1	17,425	363	–
PowerWISE Phase IV <sup>5</sup>	3	30	446,800	704,589	60,154

1. ad submission from 06/07, with (more) expenditures in 07/08

2. ad submission from 07/08, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 08/09

3. violation—ad was reviewed and did not meet the required standards

4. contravention—ad was not submitted as required (see Figure 1)

5. previously granted approval withdrawn (see comments in Chapter 5, section “Results of Our Review”)

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)					Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	Ad Value**	Total (\$)
–	54	–	–	–	–	2,663	2,717
–	7,600	1,509,077	138,844	–	21,803	–	1,697,324
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	1,200	3,605,528	474,951	45,956	367,799	–	5,920,734
–	–	–	–	–	–	7,995	7,995
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	93,611	672,861	–	318,487	377,950	–	2,113,570
–	29,539	–	–	209,352	–	–	319,671
–	–	–	–	94,927	–	–	96,702
–	1,622	–	–	–	–	–	21,522
–	–	–	–	45,412	–	–	46,166
–	–	–	–	248,735	706,493	–	1,150,843
–	–	–	–	256,819	–	–	361,626
–	–	–	–	–	–	4,320	4,320
–	–	–	–	–	–	900	900
–	–	–	–	58,860	–	–	58,860
–	317	301,092	–	–	18,665	–	330,980
–	2,500	–	–	–	–	–	95,250
–	–	–	–	–	–	1,200	4,008
–	–	–	–	19,164	–	–	27,385
–	11,228	–	–	6,187,813	–	16,932	7,527,947
–	–	–	–	–	–	181,481	318,934
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	60,381
–	285	–	–	126,089	–	–	248,072
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	17,788
–	12,800	2,229,185	–	205,950	1,334,756	–	4,994,234

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

\*\* Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
<b>Environment</b>					
CFL Green Drive	1	3	—	225,000	—
Climate Change	1	2	226,800	366,657	35,837
Green Living Show 2007 <sup>4</sup>	—	—	—	—	—
Green Living Show 2008	1	1	—	—	—
Municipal Recycling Calendars	1	2	95,863	—	—
<b>Finance</b>					
2007 Pre-Election Report	2	17	52,055	—	—
2008 Ontario Budget <sup>2</sup>	2	23	—	—	—
Ontario Savings Bonds	1	30	272,580	22,267	18,876
<b>Government and Consumer Services</b>					
Best Employers for New Canadians <sup>4</sup>	—	—	—	1,239	—
MTO Temporary Office Closure <sup>1</sup>	—	—	—	—	—
OPS Careers Advertising	1	1	—	1,500	—
ServiceOntario	9	13	45,881	955	—
ServiceOntario <sup>6</sup>	1	2	—	350	—
ServiceOntario <sup>2</sup>	1	2	—	450	—
<b>Health and Long-Term Care</b>					
Colorectal Cancer Screening	6	46	262,100	923,943	50,351
Community Health Centre Public Forum	1	1	125	—	—
e-Health Program	1	1	1,600	—	—
Health Card Notice for Northern Residents	1	1	—	—	—
Health Human Resources—HealthForceOntario	3	20	52,640	57,124	—
Health Human Resources—HealthForceOntario <sup>2</sup>	1	5	—	—	—
Hepatitis C	4	9	51,440	105,540	—
HIV Anonymous Testing Sites <sup>2</sup>	1	14	44,480	—	—
HPV Vaccination Program	2	6	77,840	97,166	11,438
Infection Control	1	1	—	—	—
Influenza	8	55	69,674	161,129	18,787
Medication Management	10	52	137,213	386,772	69,827
Nurses Awareness Campaign <sup>1</sup>	—	—	240	970	—
OHIP Office Relocation <sup>6</sup>	1	1	—	—	—
Trillium Gift of Life Network <sup>2</sup>	1	2	—	—	—
West Nile Virus	5	102	36,342	130,205	2,858

1. ad submission from 06/07, with (more) expenditures in 07/08

2. ad submission from 07/08, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 08/09

4. contravention—ad was not submitted as required (see Figure 1)

6. ad cancelled or did not run

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)					Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	Ad Value**	Total (\$)
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	225,000
–	–	1,029,477	–	–	–	–	1,658,771
–	–	–	–	–	–	500	500
–	–	–	–	–	–	500	500
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	95,863
–	4,040	–	–	208,869	–	–	264,964
–	–	–	–	133,087	–	–	133,087
43,835	7,208	833,575	251,783	873,026	118,643	–	2,441,793
–	–	–	–	33,935	–	–	35,174
–	–	–	–	978	–	–	978
–	–	–	–	22,317	–	–	23,817
–	273	–	–	3,726	65,011	–	115,846
–	57	–	–	–	–	–	407
–	57	–	–	–	–	–	507
–	6,503	717,416	–	241,686	–	–	2,201,999
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	125
–	–	–	–	–	–	2,000	3,600
–	–	–	–	1,230	–	–	1,230
–	96	64,279	48,167	153,804	–	–	376,110
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
29,345	–	1,125,764	–	391,076	–	–	1,703,165
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	44,480
–	93	–	859,371	90,255	–	–	1,136,163
–	–	–	–	25,956	–	–	25,956
–	1,100	1,530,728	286,906	489,013	135,840	–	2,693,177
–	28,184	1,081,772	743,106	176,011	370,545	–	2,993,430
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	1,210
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	530	1,135,360	257,254	169,705	352,486	–	2,084,740

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

\*\* Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
<b>Health Promotion</b>					
Cessation—Smoke-free Ontario	8	44	269,802	354,917	84,649
Doors Open Ontario <sup>4</sup>	—	—	—	—	—
EatRight Ontario	2	32	86,942	170,783	37,051
Healthy Eating and Active Living	4	30	—	284,088	21,360
Royal Winter Fair	1	2	—	—	—
Stupid.ca (anti-tobacco)	5	10	126,110	165,824	30,083
<b>Intergovernmental Affairs and Democratic Renewal Secretariat</b>					
The Citizens' Assembly Public Consultation Meetings	1	2	—	1,210	—
<b>Labour</b>					
Minimum Wage Increase 2008	1	12	2,189	—	—
<b>Municipal Affairs and Housing</b>					
Brownfields Ontario	1	1	—	—	—
Canada-Ontario Affordable Housing Program	1	2	—	—	—
Greenbelt Expansion Criteria Consultations <sup>2</sup>	3	6	—	67	—
Managing Natural Heritage System in Central Pickering	2	4	—	342	—
<b>Natural Resources</b>					
Algonquin Provincial Park	2	2	—	—	—
Bear Wise	2	10	—	15,347	—
Crown Land Camping Zone Expansion	1	1	—	—	—
Family Fishing Weekend <sup>2</sup>	1	1	—	—	—
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention <sup>1</sup>	—	—	—	—	—
FireSmart Wildfire Prevention	1	2	—	756	—
Fort Frances Advisory Committee	1	1	—	—	—
Kirkland Lake Management Strategy	1	1	—	—	—
Land Information Ontario	1	1	—	—	—
National Fishing Week	1	1	—	227	—
Ontario Parks <sup>1</sup>	—	—	—	—	—
Ontario Parks	11	17	—	1,309	—
Ontario Parks, Northern Ontario	5	6	—	—	—
Ontario Parks Planning Templates	1	17	—	—	—
Outdoors Card	1	1	—	138	—
Park Management Plans	3	3	—	—	—
Seasonal Leasing of Campsite Program <sup>2</sup>	5	6	—	—	—
Temagami Parks <sup>1</sup>	—	—	—	—	—
Vegetation Management Plans	1	1	—	—	—
Woodland Caribou Provincial Park, Snowmobilers Reminder	1	1	—	—	—

1. ad submission from 06/07, with (more) expenditures in 07/08

2. ad submission from 07/08, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 08/09

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)					Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	Ad Value**	Total (\$)
–	1,359	1,839,941	18,204	636,996	255,878	–	3,461,746
–	–	–	–	–	–	15,000	15,000
181,495	438	171,220	–	792,605	110,200	–	1,550,734
–	2,381	337,465	–	–	–	108,000	753,294
–	–	–	–	–	–	10,000	10,000
–	–	581,644	–	10,174	727,831	–	1,641,666
–	–	–	–	95,550	–	–	96,760
–	6,000	–	–	122,270	–	–	130,459
–	–	–	–	–	–	2,420	2,420
–	–	–	–	–	–	70,000	70,000
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	67
–	–	–	–	23,724	–	–	24,066
–	–	–	–	1,290	–	–	1,290
–	227	–	48,098	176,872	–	–	240,544
–	–	–	–	837	–	–	837
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	8,819	–	–	8,819
–	–	–	–	1,004	–	–	1,760
–	–	–	–	706	–	–	706
–	–	–	–	216	–	–	216
–	–	–	–	1,490	–	–	1,490
–	–	–	–	–	–	10,410	10,637
–	–	–	–	2,950	–	–	2,950
–	–	78,910	–	30,872	–	14,955	126,046
–	–	–	–	10,374	–	–	10,374
–	144	–	–	19,237	–	–	19,381
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	138
–	–	–	–	3,346	–	–	3,346
–	46	–	–	3,234	–	–	3,280
–	125	–	–	770	–	–	895
–	–	–	–	275	–	–	275
–	–	–	–	342	–	–	342

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

\*\* Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.

Ministry/Campaign Title	# of Submissions	# of Items	Agency Costs (\$)	Third-party Costs (\$)	
				Production	Talent
<b>Northern Development and Mines</b>					
GeologyOntario <sup>1</sup>	–	–	–	–	–
Northern Ontario Heritage Fund Corporation	1	2	–	–	–
<b>Small Business and Entrepreneurship</b>					
Summer Company Student Businesses	1	4	70,875	16,558	10,242
<b>Training, Colleges and Universities</b>					
Colleges Collective Bargaining Act Review	1	2	2,770	–	–
Employment Ontario Awareness <sup>1</sup>	–	–	572	38	–
Employment Ontario Awareness <sup>2</sup>	1	1	–	–	–
OSAP Access Window <sup>1</sup>	–	–	7,908	10,022	–
Studying Abroad <sup>1</sup>	–	–	5,960	–	–
<b>Transportation</b>					
Veterans' Licence Plates <sup>2</sup>	2	3	–	–	–
<b>Total</b>	<b>184</b>	<b>914</b>	<b>4,290,451</b>	<b>6,279,102</b>	<b>799,814</b>

1. ad submission from 06/07, with (more) expenditures in 07/08

2. ad submission from 07/08, with (more) expenditures to be reported in 08/09

Third-party Costs (\$) cont'd		Media Costs (\$)					Campaign
Bulk Mail	Other	TV	Radio	Print	Out-of-Home*	Ad Value**	Total (\$)
–	–	–	–	13,594	–	–	13,594
–	–	–	–	6,230	–	–	6,230
–	2,005	–	304,926	–	–	–	404,606
–	43	–	–	13,072	–	–	15,885
–	–	–	–	–	–	5,000	5,610
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	–
–	–	–	–	152,555	–	–	170,485
–	–	–	–	–	–	–	5,960
–	–	629,778	–	78,251	–	–	708,029
<b>254,675</b>	<b>221,665</b>	<b>19,475,072</b>	<b>3,431,610</b>	<b>13,039,893</b>	<b>4,963,900</b>	<b>454,276</b>	<b>53,210,458</b>

\* Out-of-Home advertising includes, for example, billboards and transit posters.

\*\* Ad Value denotes the value of an ad space provided to government offices at no cost, often where the government has provided funding for a related event/publication.